

Keys for Improving Citizens' Satisfaction with Public Services of Local Government

Mohamed Almihat^{1*}, Ma. June S. Carlos², Edwin T. Caoleng³, Patricia Ann D. Estrada⁴

¹ College of public administration and Governance, Tarlac state university, Philippines

¹Ph.D. Candidate at Cape peninsula university of technology, Cape Town, South Africa

² College of public administration and Governance, Tarlac state university, Philippines

³ Dean of College of public administration and Governance, Tarlac state university, Philippines

⁴lecturer at College of public administration and Governance, Tarlac state university, Philippines

*Corresponding author: almehat@gmail.com

Article history

Received: July 21, 2022

Accepted: August 01, 2022

Published: August 02, 2022

Keywords:

Local government

Citizens Satisfaction

Public Services

E-Government

Abstract:

the people, companies, and workers in both the public and private sectors make up the large consumer base of the government. The government offers information and services to each group of its customers via its agencies, departments, and ministries, it was further said, therefore the only people who can objectively assess its success are the people who use it. Customer satisfaction is the primary criterion for assessing the quality of the product or service, as well as the ancillary services and key performance indicators of public organizations, that are supplied to clients. In order to enhance the quality of a product or service and provide a firm with a competitive edge, measuring customer satisfaction is an essential component of the process. Therefore, this paper reviews the importance of delivering good quality services to the citizens. The first section gives an overview of the relationship and trust between consumers and the government. While second part addresses the role of Local government in prompting e-government and ensuring citizens' privacy and security. Finally, discussing improving the public services delivery and the way forward in the modern era. Hence, the contribution of this paper mainly focused on investigating the public services, it opens more opportunities for further research in the field of citizen's satiation and local government.

Cite this article as: M. Almihat, Ma. June S. Carlos, Edwin T. Caoleng, and Patricia Ann D. Estrada, "Keys for Improving Citizens' Satisfaction with Public Services of Local Government," *African Journal of Advanced Pure and Applied Sciences (AJAPAS)*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 73–80, August 2022.

Publisher's Note: African Academy of Advanced Studies – AAAS stays neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



Copyright: © 2022 by the authors. Licensee African Journal of Advanced Pure and Applied Sciences (AJAPAS), Libya. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

Introduction

Satisfaction requires a moment of truth or experience of the service before evaluating how satisfied the service recipient is. According to [1] satisfaction is a positive disconfirmed expectation, while [2] stated that it is a post-consumption experience that compares perceived quality with expected quality. Moreover, [3] argued that

satisfaction could be broadly characterized as a post-purchase evaluation of product quality given pre-purchase expectations. Moreover, customer satisfaction will depend on confidence in the quality of service.

The development of customer satisfaction indices for the services given by inspectors in certain departments where is Al-Ain Municipality, United Arab Emirates. They discovered that consumer satisfaction indices and trust scores were in the middle of the eighties, suggesting strong levels of customer contentment and trust [4].

The definition of consumer satisfaction given by [5] might be transaction-specific or cumulative. This consumer analyzes the service and decides their level of satisfaction at initial contact. However, analyze the satisfaction of recurring consumers from the first time they used the service to the present. From the perspective of the government, conducting a customer satisfaction survey will help to obtain the best available information by learning their opinions and perceptions, comprehending the impact of alternative options based on whether or not they meet customers' needs, and mitigating the risk of unintended consequences, if not eliminating them entirely. The relationship between customer perception of service as an experience and service quality evaluation remains true for both the experience and the evaluation of quality. According to [6] indicated five recognized vital factors that customers use to measure service quality: reliability, assurance, responsiveness, tangibles, and empathy. Where, it is relevant across a broad spectrum of service businesses to better understand the expectations and perceptions of their consumers regarding service quality. Hence, this will aid the service provider in determining whether the existing service meets and satisfies consumer expectations. In addition, several researchers have shown a correlation between voters' contentment with the democratic functioning of political systems and their trust in government and political institutions [7]. Hence, most Studies focused on the elements that influence people's views and opinions, but less attention was paid to the performance and services provided by local authorities. Indeed, in this type of analysis, measuring citizens' trust in government is focused on evaluating the effectiveness of the decision-making process and, at the very least, the public reception of the government's general policies, but not on the improvement in the quality of public services that affect people's everyday lives.

The common sense suggests that citizens as actors and as players in policy making and the receivers of the public services have a voice in constructing performance measures that assess the quality and impact of services. The citizen satisfaction methods stress the importance of the link between a municipality and its constituents and that a well-performing municipal government is the one that can satisfy the needs of local citizens who are the beneficiaries of its services. The perceived quality of government outcomes represented by its services is more important to citizens than the way in which resources are utilized to generate these outcomes. Citizen satisfaction can be used as a measure of institutional performance and how local government can respond to the needs.

In Libya, several studies have attempted to identify and examine the factors that affect citizen satisfaction with E-government worldwide; yet, there are challenges that no one study can investigate when it comes to a relationship between governments and citizens. In this relationship, many elements exist: culture, availability of the internet and population to name a few, that differ from one country to another. Moreover, national technological advances will impact in a county dependent upon the new or different components themselves and how they are related to online services and, particularly the rate of adoption which differs significantly between one country and another. Hence, the factors cannot be generalized globally.

Satisfaction has been defined in the Cambridge dictionary as “a pleasant feeling that you get when you receive something you wanted, or when you have done something you wanted to do”. Satisfaction is crucial for strengthening long-term relationships between citizens and E-government.

[8] led a study entitled, “Customer Satisfaction on the Quality Services of one Department Store in Batangas City, Philippines.” The study aims to assess the customer satisfaction on the quality service of one Department Store in Batangas City. Specifically, to assess the level of customer satisfaction on the quality service of the Department Store in terms of employee's professional appearance, customer relation, customer service and facilities; test relationship between respondent's profile and customer satisfaction, and propose plan of action to improve the satisfaction of customer. A total of 100 respondents were involved in a descriptive research. The results showed that customers are satisfied on the quality of service of this Department Store. Thus, management may continuously provide orientation and training to employees on customer relations and services to meet the full satisfaction of the customers.

The Citizen Satisfaction and the Kaleidoscope of Government Performance: How Multiple Stakeholders See Government Performance was a study led by [9]. This study investigates how different performance assessments relate to each other by incorporating multiple stakeholders' perspectives on performance at the individual level. Combining three different surveys and archival data on secondary education, we analyze how academic performance indicators are associated with service users' (parents' and students') and service providers' (teachers') judgments of school quality. Our findings suggest that parents, students, and teachers provide similar assessments of school performance, and these assessments reflect the actual quality of the schools. Their evaluations are more closely aligned to archival performance indicators in high-performing schools than low-performing schools. In addition to the convergent validity of the various performance measures, we also find indirect evidence that the perceptual measures have discriminant validity relative to archival measures. The consistency of performance indicators in a centralized regime (South Korea) also contributes to the generalizability of existing theory.

[10] conducted a study titled, "A Review of Effects of Quality Municipal Services on Citizen Satisfaction in Malaysian Municipal Council: A Content Analysis," argues that the constitutional mandate of local council in terms of "function performance" has not been translated into reality in many occasions. Thus, the paper concludes and recommends that municipal council must attempt to overcome the challenges that have by-passed their performance. It is only by this can they be positioned to render cutting services in a timely, effective, adequate, prompt and satisfactory manner to justify their continuous existence and huge financial allocations to them. Municipal awareness also gives a sense of satisfaction of the citizens. The study recommends that there is needs for local municipal to be strategies to makes the local council more robust for enhancing the lives of inhabitants and to foster good relationship between the management and local people in the area. The study also gives recommendation of enlighten the local community on the important of community participation in provision and maintenance of public service delivery.

[11] led a study titled, "Citizen satisfaction with municipal services: The case of Konya municipality." According to the result of this study conducted with the aim of determining and analyzing the satisfaction of citizens about local services in Konya; it was concluded that citizens were in general terms satisfied with local-public services to a large extent. It was detected that socio-demographic features of citizens affected satisfaction level in some service kinds and it was observed that these findings of the study were in parallel with the results of similar studies conducted in the literature.

[12] conducted a study titled, "Prediction of citizen satisfaction with local government based on perceptions of physical disorder," identify the aspects of service quality that citizens view as most important regarding the improvement of their quality of life within the city where they live, by finding out the intangible variables or factors that most influence citizen satisfaction with the local government. This uses a measuring instrument to obtain survey data and build a theoretical and empirical model that operates at the level of the local government. Findings of the study revealed that emergent model discriminates three areas pertaining to quality of services, its relationship with the satisfaction of citizens in local government across local leadership image and expectations.

Moreover, the authors [13] led a study titled, "Factors Influencing Citizen Satisfaction in Getting Public Service (Case Study: The Service User of The Investment and One Stop Service Agency of Tanah Bumbu Regency In 2018)," explained factors influencing citizen satisfaction service in the Investment and One-Stop Service Agency of Tanah Bumbu Regency. In particular, this research analyses the level of citizen satisfaction and the extent to which Awareness, Rules, Organizational, Income, Skill-Ability, and Service Facility Factor Influence Citizen Satisfaction. This study uses a mixed methodology with a sequential explanatory strategy. Using the incidental sampling with Slovin's Formula to calculate the number of samples is 93 respondents. The quantitative data were analyzed by the SmartPLS 3.0 program. The findings showed that the level of citizen satisfaction is included in the category "Satisfied". Furthermore, the variable of Citizen Satisfaction is influenced by variables of Awareness, Rules, Organizational, Income, Skill-Ability dan Service Facility Factor for 70,5%. Whereas Awareness, Rules, Organizational, and Skill-Ability Factor has a significant influence on Citizen Satisfaction. Besides, Income and Service Facility Factor do not have a significant influence on Citizen Satisfaction

In addition, [14] directed a study titled, “The impact of customer service orientation on public service motives.” The results of this study support the findings from the first phase of investigation, showing that customer service orientation has a significant impact on public service motives, although the strength of the relationship between the two constructs is weaker than expected. However, given the motivation is a complex construct influenced by a number of different factors even a small variance is significant. The most important aspect of the findings however, is the strong association of the culture and philosophy-based interpretation on public service motives.

In a study by [15] titled “Using Psychological Theories to Understand Citizen Using Psychological Theories to Understand Citizen Attitudes Toward Government Performance and Attitudes Toward Government Performance And Collaborative Behaviors in the Public Sector.” Findings revealed that the first essay explored the role of detailed versus abstract mental construal’s in understanding the relationship between expectations of public service performance and attitudes toward a government. Type of thinking, when it fit well with the information about either how or why public services were provided, was predicted to produce more positive attitudes toward government than in the absence of fit. However, these predictions were not confirmed. The second essay induced either an abstract or a detailed mode thinking in participants. Because abstract thinkers are more likely to focus on the desirability of outcomes, and detailed thinkers are more likely to focus on the feasibility of outcomes, it was predicted that abstract thinking, compared to detailed thinking, would create higher expectations of public services and lower perceived government performance. The findings were inconclusive. The final essay, combining prospect theory and expectancy-disconfirmation concepts, proposed a new model testing the relationship between citizen attitudes and collaborative behavior. Using a cross-sectional data set of US citizens, the results revealed a predicted non-linear relationship between citizen satisfaction with government performance and coproduction

Hence, the study entitled “The Study of Service Quality in Libyan Commercial Banks,” was conducted by [16] The findings of the present study have produced some important results. Firstly, there are significant differences between the Libyan private and public banking sectors in terms of customer and bankers' standpoints of service quality. Secondly, customers' expectations of banks services were higher in the private banks than in the public banks. Thirdly, customers' perceptions of the banks services were higher in the public banks compared with the private banks. Fourthly, the gap between customers' expectations and perceptions of services provided by public and private banks is generally widest in public banks in the majority of the 22 items. Fifthly, employees' perceptions of customers' expectations in both banks had high scores in the bank's service quality. Finally, the results also show that the interviews provided another layer of information that contributed extremely well to the overall understanding of the service quality in Libyan commercial banks.

Moreover, according to [17] conducted a study entitled, “Study of Customer Satisfaction in the Banking Sector in Libya.” The findings based on three different independent variables (service quality, customer loyalty and security) showed that all these variables influenced consumers’ satisfaction in Libyan banking sector. There is a positive and significant relationship between the customer satisfaction and two variables (service quality and customer loyalty), and there is negative and significant relationship between security and customer satisfaction.

(Ali alameen et al., 2020) conducted a study titled, “Satisfaction Assessment of Housing Users in Tripoli – Libya.” Findings shows that there has been an increase in natural population growth as well as migration from neighboring cities. To accommodate population growth, governments have implemented a number of development projects, particularly in the housing sector. The aim of this paper is to evaluate the satisfaction of housing users in accordance with the previous housing policies of successive Libyan governments. The data was collected by means of questionnaires concerning the social aspects of housing occupants and their suitability for the Libyan family both currently and in the future. Moreover, there remains the question of what characteristics should be taken into account when implementing future housing projects. The study included cases of housing projects implemented for the purpose of assessing the satisfaction of users with projects to implement the principles of “Sustainable Housing.” The survey included four residential projects carried out in the city of Tripoli for the research. The sites are: (i) Airport Road East Housing Project (ii) Al Hadba Khdra Housing Project (iii) Ghot AshAhaal Housing Project (iv) Souq-Atolata (North) Housing Project. The paper also aims to benefit from the study results for the implementation of the “Sustainable Housing Policy in Libya: A Case Study of Tripoli” for

the purpose of applying the principles of social sustainability to housing, especially in Tripoli and Libya in general. Additionally, this paper will be useful for planning and architectural professionals.

The role of local government in improving citizens' satisfaction

Local governments, which are the closest administrative entities to the inhabitants, are thus primarily responsible for meeting the everyday needs of their local community. Moreover, Local governments are linked directly to the citizens they serve. This proximity increases the residents' face-to-face interaction with local governments and administrations. Local governments, which have elected decision-making bodies, strive to provide the best possible service with the funds allocated. In a way, local government organizations' destinies are determined by the services they deliver to the residents under their jurisdiction. Locally, the success of administrators, their political parties, and the ideologies they represent are judged by the degree to which residents are satisfied with the services. In municipal administrations, the post of the leader is distinct. In the same manner, as in other local administrations, leaders are elected to office. However, they are relentlessly sought, and their actions determine the course of their respective enterprises. This leadership role carries a responsibility for the conduct of the local governments. In addition, leaders influence residents' impressions of the local government by their qualities, attributes, personal abilities, and skills[19]. Moreover, these are constitutional institutions founded on legal order, and the purpose of local government is to serve the specific and local interests of the people who reside in cities or districts. Local governments, part of the political and economic system, are crucial for public administrations to identify essential local services and achieve citizen satisfaction[20]. According to [21] the more units delivering public services are reduced, the simpler it is to describe the requirements and expectations of people and raise their satisfaction via the provision of services that meet those needs and expectations. Hence, Local government have become one of the most influential authorities in enhancing public satisfaction. The notion that "people consume what public institutions supply" has been supplanted by "citizen centered administration" in the current day, which is partly influenced by globalization.

The concept of new public management needs the citizens to be considered as consumers and there to be a continuous evaluation of performance. According to the strategy, internal efficiency should be paired with exterior citizen satisfaction[22]. In such an approach, which places the people upfront, the contentment of the citizens with the products and services given is vital. While the rate of citizens, whose demands are addressed, is improved; it becomes possible to enhance citizen satisfaction as well. In this regard, the public administration should accept the views of the people, decide if the services are delivered in line with the requests and requirements of the citizens, and create the appropriate rules that are needed. Local governments are one of the institutions where the wants and requirements of the residents are or should be primarily regarded, merely because they are the closest units to the citizens within public administration[23]. Furthermore, governmental organizations posed questions directly regarding how the service was given within proper encounters. Moreover, the European Public Administration Network (EUPAN) stressed, on the other hand, that public survey satisfaction evaluated the appropriation of certain activities or their irrelevance in attaining the bottom line. Users of Business Process and Licensing aren't only paying clients of the government; they're also people who are evaluating the service [24].

The various relationships between the state and administrative clients are taxpayers and regulated subjects. Customers acknowledged that they had definite responsibilities toward the tax administration. However, by and large, they anticipated a particular degree of assistance or support that would enable them to carry out their tasks. Customers have legally defined duties. They know that firms are subject to inspection, but customers expect appropriate and quick actions by regulators or the government. The government then has to assist and tell consumers how they will carry out their responsibility in the process of service[25].

Important of enhancing citizens' awareness

According to [26] citizens' awareness of municipal operations, may boost citizen support for municipal outcome. Local outcomes, mostly represented by municipal services, are frequently hampered by the public's ignorance of local processes and procedures. Therefore, well-designed feedback mechanisms and favorable citizens' perception are crucial for effective municipal performance, and more pleasant service delivery. Moreover, as stated in [27] through media interventions, public campaigns, and public forums, individuals' awareness of local government activities and operations can increase their ability to advocate for their interests and hold local authorities accountable for their decisions and actions. Increasing citizen understanding of municipal issues is a powerful technique for fostering citizen engagement and enhancing service delivery. A productive connection between municipal authorities Citizens' understanding of municipal activity may increase their support for municipal results. Local outcomes, mostly represented by municipal services, are frequently hampered by the public's

ignorance of local processes and procedures. Therefore, well-designed feedback systems and a positive public perception are essential for effective municipal performance and improved service delivery.

E-Government

State The success of e-government services is largely dependent on customer satisfaction. The sum of a person's feelings and actions concerning visual aspects that influence his or her level of satisfaction is known as "user satisfaction.". Therefore, E-government services must be simple to use so that everyone, regardless of experience, may use them without exerting too much effort [28]. As explained in [29] that the information offered in online services must be organized in clear and straightforward structures based on their importance and citizens' demands so that citizens can easily find what they seek. In addition, they assert that if the information were difficult to find and citizens lacked the capacity to complete transactions, adoption and satisfaction with e-government services would drop. [30] conducted a study entitled, "A Study of Citizen Satisfaction for e-Governance Initiative SETU in Maharashtra (INDIA)," revealed that the citizens are marginally satisfied with service quality and that the government has to reengineer its current processes and introduce the latest technologies in order to accomplish its objectives of accessibility, efficiency and service levels.

Accessibility is also one of the ACSI (American Customer Service Index) model's factors for assessing customer satisfaction. It refers to the capacity to search and navigate a website freely. Additionally, the extent to which a service can reach as many citizens as possible and if it is compatible with all devices and can execute transactions on all operating systems are considered [31]. The authors [32] examined the aspect of accessibility and identified a substantial positive correlation between e- Satisfaction and citizens. Where, security and privacy assure that e-government websites deliver secure services without any uncertainties or negative repercussions for their use[33].

Conclusion

As a result, the government must investigate techniques to increase the services they deliver in order to satisfy the expectations of its residents. It changes and refreshes its methods in administering public service in order to establish confidence towards its customer. Moreover, people with low levels of trust will be more easily provoked by unfavorable situations. As emphasized that it would be gradual and troublesome to rebuild the trust in public policy and institutions. It will badly damage or influence their credibility and may perhaps escalate and view as a whole for public service. There is a need for the government to revitalize local services, boost administrative performance, and to generate competitive, knowledgeable local officials and workers. Changes and development in the commercial sector, advancement of technology has also created pressure on public sector as constituents are more interested into a rapid reliable performance when availing sort of service that the government is executing.

References

- [1] G. H. g. Mcdougall and T. Levesque, 'Customer satisfaction with services: putting perceived value into the equation', *J. Serv. Mark.*, vol. 14, no. 5, pp. 392–410, 2000, doi: 10.1108/08876040010340937.
- [2] N. Koenig-Lewis and A. Palmer, 'The effects of anticipatory emotions on service satisfaction and behavioral intention', *J. Serv. Mark.*, vol. 28, no. 6, pp. 437–451, 2014, doi: 10.1108/JSM-09-2013-0244.
- [3] I. Zakaria, B. A. Rahman, A. K. Othman, N. A. M. Yunus, M. R. Dzulkippli, and M. A. F. Osman., 'The Relationship between Loyalty Program, Customer Satisfaction and Customer Loyalty in Retail Industry: A Case Study', *Procedia - Soc. Behav. Sci.*, vol. 129, pp. 23–30, 2014, doi: 10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.03.643.
- [4] Z. Zakaria, Z. Hussin, and M. Sawal, 'Customer Satisfaction in Municipal Services: An Empirical Study in Majlis Perbandaran Sungai Petani (MPSPK)', *2011 Int. Conf. Manag. Artif. Intell.*, vol. 6, pp. 128–132, 2011, [Online]. Available: <http://www.ipedr.net/vol6/25-A10020.pdf>.
- [5] and G. D. Siew Loke, Ayankunle Taiwo Hanisah Mat Salim, 'Service Quality and Customer Satisfaction in a Telecommunication Service Provider', *2011 Int. Conf. Financ. Manag. Econ.*, vol. 11, pp. 24–29, 2011.
- [6] S. Mokhlis, Y. Aleesa, and I. Mamat, 'Municipal Service Quality and Citizen Satisfaction in Southern Thailand', *J. Public Adm. Gov.*, vol. 1, no. 1, p. 122, 2011, doi: 10.5296/jpag.v1i1.717.
- [7] P. Hitlin and N. Shutava, 'Trust in Government: A CLOSE LOOK AT PUBLIC PERCEPTIONS OF THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT AND ITS EMPLOYEES', 2022.
- [8] A. Margarita *et al.*, 'Customer Satisfaction on the Quality Services of one Department Store in Batangas

- City, Philippines', *Asia Pacific J. Acad. Res. Bus. Adm.*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 1–10, 2015.
- [9] M. Song and K. J. Meier, 'Citizen Satisfaction and the Kaleidoscope of Government Performance: How Multiple Stakeholders See Government Performance', *J. Public Adm. Res. Theory*, vol. 28, no. 4, pp. 489–505, 2018, doi: 10.1093/jopart/muy006.
 - [10] B. MU, M. D, and K. R, 'A Review of Effects of Quality Municipal Services on Citizen Satisfaction in Malaysian Municipal Council: A Content Analysis', *Glob. J. Res. Rev.*, vol. 04, no. 03, 2017, doi: 10.21767/2393-8854.100028.
 - [11] E. Örselli, E. Bayrakçı, and S. Kahraman, 'Citizen satisfaction with municipal services: The case of Konya', *Glob. J. Sociol. Curr. Issues*, vol. 7, no. 1, pp. 24–33, 2017, doi: 10.18844/gjs.v7i1.2366.
 - [12] H. O. Nigro and S. E. G. Císaro, 'Prediction of citizen satisfaction with local government based on perceptions of physical disorder', *J. Place Manag. Dev.*, vol. 7, no. 2, pp. 153–175, 2014, doi: 10.1108/JPMD-09-2013-0021.
 - [13] M. Iqbal, I. Mahbubah, A. Akbar, and Y. Elianda, 'Factors Influencing Citizen Satisfaction in Getting Public Service (Case Study: The Service User of The Investment and One Stop Service Agency of Tanah Bumbu Regency In 2018)', *Gorontalo J. Gov. Polit. Stud.*, vol. 3, no. 1, p. 001, 2020, doi: 10.32662/gjgops.v3i1.826.
 - [14] P. J. Pantea, 'The impact of customer service orientation on public service motives', p. 110, 2014.
 - [15] J. Y. Mok, 'Using Psychological Theories To understand Citizen Attitudes toward Government Performance and Collaborative Behaviors in the Public Sector', p. 148, 2018.
 - [16] M. A. Elmadani, 'The Study of Service Quality in Libyan Commercial Banks', 2015, [Online]. Available: [http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/28323/1/Final thesis - ELMADANI.pdf](http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/28323/1/Final%20thesis%20-%20ELMADANI.pdf).
 - [17] L. Murugiah and H. A. Akgam, 'Study of Customer Satisfaction in the Banking Sector in Libya', *J. Econ. Bus. Manag.*, vol. 3, no. 7, pp. 674–677, 2015, doi: 10.7763/joebm.2015.v3.264.
 - [18] O. ALÌ ALAMEEN, G. ÇELEBİ, and M. TUNCER, *Satisfaction Assessment of Housing Users in Tripoli – Libya*, vol. 1, no. 1. 2020.
 - [19] T. Nabatchi and L. B. Amsler, 'Direct Public Engagement in Local Government', *Am. Rev. Public Adm.*, vol. 44, no. 4 SUPPL., 2014, doi: 10.1177/0275074013519702.
 - [20] A. I. Yastrebova, A. I. Stakhov, V. M. Redkous, A. N. Gubin, and T. Y. Suchkova, 'State and non-state actors ensuring constitutional order and public security: Problems of legal regulation of interaction the ability to understand and the textual typologies in the primary basic education, third grade', *Univ. y Soc.*, vol. 12, no. 3, pp. 228–239, 2020.
 - [21] Y. Zhao, L. Liu, Y. Qi, F. Lou, J. Zhang, and W. Ma, 'Evaluation and design of public health information management system for primary health care units based on medical and health information', *J. Infect. Public Health*, vol. 13, no. 4, pp. 491–496, 2020, doi: 10.1016/j.jiph.2019.11.004.
 - [22] F. Magno and F. C. A. Marino, 'Exploring customers' reaction to product recall messages: the role of responsibility, opportunism and brand reputation', *Glob. Conf. Bus. Econ.*, vol. 10, 2010.
 - [23] T. Schillemans and K. H. Bjurström, 'Trust and verification: balancing agency and stewardship theory in the governance of agencies', *Int. Public Manag. J.*, vol. 23, no. 5, pp. 650–676, 2020, doi: 10.1080/10967494.2018.1553807.
 - [24] B. Verschuere, T. Brandsen, and K. Johnston, *Public Administration in Europe*, no. January. 2019.
 - [25] M. Gombár, A. Korauš, A. Vagaská, and Š. Tóth, 'Analytical View on the Sustainable Development of Tax and Customs Administration in the Context of Selected Groups of the Population of the Slovak Republic', *Sustain.*, vol. 14, no. 3, 2022, doi: 10.3390/su14031891.
 - [26] S. O. Almarshad, 'Municipal awareness and citizen satisfaction: The case of northern borders in Saudi Arabia', *Int. Rev. Manag. Mark.*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 94–101, 2015.
 - [27] A. Haro-de-Rosario, A. Sáez-Martín, and M. del Carmen Caba-Pérez, 'Using social media to enhance citizen engagement with local government: Twitter or Facebook?', *New Media Soc.*, vol. 20, no. 1, pp.

- 29–49, 2018, doi: 10.1177/1461444816645652.
- [28] S. N. Momotaz and M. S. Hasan, ‘Exploring the Impact of Service Quality Factors on Customer Satisfaction towards Online Shopping: Evidence from Bangladesh’, *World J. Soc. Sci.*, vol. 8, no. 1, pp. 102–123, 2018.
- [29] M. M. Rahim and I. Alharbi, ‘User satisfaction with e-government websites: An Australian experience’, *2014 17th Int. Conf. Comput. Inf. Technol. ICCIT 2014*, pp. 245–249, 2014, doi: 10.1109/ICCITech.2014.7073158.
- [30] P. N. and H. Diwakar, ‘A Study of Citizen Satisfaction for e-Governance Initiative SETU in Maharashtra (INDIA)’, *Int. J. Comput. Appl.*, vol. 124, no. 17, pp. 12–19, 2015, doi: 10.5120/ijca2015905819.
- [31] N. Chaloux, G. Boisjoly, E. Grisé, A. El-Geneidy, and D. Levinson, ‘I only get some satisfaction: Introducing satisfaction into measures of accessibility’, *Transp. Res. Part F Traffic Psychol. Behav.*, vol. 62, pp. 833–843, 2019, doi: 10.1016/j.trf.2019.03.008.
- [32] O. Bin Musa, F. Abuwdn, I. A. Binti Zolkifly, and A. Almasri, ‘Factors affecting Libyan citizens satisfaction with e-government services’, *Int. J. Innov. Creat. Chang.*, vol. 6, no. 4, pp. 1–23, 2019.
- [33] M. Bhuvana and S. Vasantha, ‘Assessment of rural citizens satisfaction on the service quality of common service centers (CSCs) of e-governance’, *J. Crit. Rev.*, vol. 7, no. 5, pp. 302–305, 2020, doi: 10.31838/jcr.07.05.56.

Author’s short biography (Optional)

Authors Name: Dr. Mohamed Almihat,

Holds M.Sc degree in Electrical Engineering major in power system, From Tarlac State University, Philippines, , and the MPA from Tarlac State university and a Doctorate of public administration major in socioeconomic and development from the University Tarlac State University, Ph.D. student in Department of Engineering Electronic and Computer Engineering, Cape peninsula the University of Technology, And Member of CPDES at Cape peninsula University of Technology

Passport size
photograph

Dr. Almihat Interests include control of power converters, Microgrids, renewable energy systems, and sustainable developments.

Authors Name: Prof Dr. Ma. June S. Carlos

Associate Professor V and Former Dean of College of public administration and Governance, Tarlac state university, Philippines

Holds BS Chemical Engineering, Master of Public Administration, Doctor of Public Administration.

Passport size
photograph

Prof. Carlos research internets in public policy, organization and managements, Public Administration and Sustainable development.

Authors Name: Prof Dr. Edwin T. Caoleng

Dean of College of public administration and Governance, Tarlac state university, Philippines.

Holds BS Marketing Management, BS Nursing, Master of Business Administration
Doctor of Public Administration, and Doctor of Business Administration

Passport size
photograph

Prof. Caoleng research interests in health managements, Public administration, Policy, Tourism, and public administration theories.
